

Cultural Security: Stagnation or Safety?

Asst. Lectu. Sophia Butt

English Language and Applied Linguistics, Arts , Law and Social Policy , University of Brimingham

sophiabutt72@gmail.com

Received: 16 August 2017 Accepted: 21 November 2017

Turnitin - passed research





Abstract

When reflecting on the concept of cultural security, it is important to be mindful of its multi-faceted existenceand its far-reaching impact on individuals across the world, and, if pondered from a theological perspective, in thehereafter, too. Definitions of the term 'culture' are largely demographic in nature, premised on the idiosyncrasies of a nation. They commonly focus on heritage and both the conservation and celebration of diversity in architecture, art, clothes, cuisine, language, literature, music, religion, tradition, and much more. Culture is, therefore, the manifestation of a multi-layered reality, a tool through which individuals craft their identity and their paths through life. Thus, it is no surprise that the preservation of cultures is of paramount importance to anthropologists, sociologists and some theologians, and naturally, individuals whopossessan innate desire to seek comfort in the familiar. However, in recent years, the term cultural security has also taken on meanings other than those associated exclusively with nations and individuals.

Keywords: cultural security, safety, characteristic of neoliberalism, Cultural Heritage





Introduction

This paper aims to take a holistic approach to examining cultural security by consideringthe degree to whichthe conceptmight be synonymous withmatters including, but not limited to,individual identity, societal securityand/orreligious security. Inreflecting oneach of the aforementioned, it will discuss the degree of truth, if any, in the belief of many – typically in the West – thatthe desire forcultural securityin different forms can be equated with cultural stagnation. A question that naturally arises from this is whether there are situations wheredeviations may be permissible, and if so, the extent to which compromise is acceptable beforecultural security comes under threat. The paper will close by drawing on verses from the Holy Qur'an that refer to 'security'so as to reflect on the different contexts in which the term is used, and can therefore be understood.

Definitions of Cultural Security

The term cultural security is defined in a variety of ways depending on the discipline and/or institution within which it is situated. Before proceeding to the discussionpart of this paper, this sectionhighlights some of the most frequently found, yet diverse definitions of this term that are commonplace today.

From an anthropological viewpoint, cultural security has traditionally been concerned with mitigating threats surrounding the manipulation of culture that would result in the modification of authentic cultural practices by the collective, i.e.: society. More recently, the term has been extended by some to be defined as a "characteristic of neoliberalism1"in which the State plays an important role with the function of security-makers for stabilisation.

Interpretations of cultural security from a **political** perspectivecontinue to focus heavily [though not exclusively] on the management of wartime threats, terrorism, and anti-ethnic cleansing. This has become noticeably pronounced following the events of 9/11 in New



York. Yet, within this discipline, what was once claimed to be about reducing or eliminating environmental and social degradation and injustice2now also incorporates discourses which seek to challenge differing values and fundamental principles of belief which could, and in some casesdo, result in threats for society at the macro- and mirco-level.

According to the Australian **Human Rights** Commission and other similar committees, cultural security is used to oppose lateral violence, which is violence aimed at peers, including the type enacted by one minority group against another3. The most common example of this is one linked to indigenous peoples, like the Aborigines in Australia whose rights continue to be usurped.

In **sociological** terms, cultural security is related to both personal and collective identities. In his chapter entitled, 'Cultural Security & Global Governance – International Migration & Negotiations of Identity4,' Majid Tehranian (2004) discusses cultural securityandinsecurity, before simply defining the former as "the freedom to negotiate one's identity" (p.7) and relates this to multiple identities and citizenships. In the case of the latter, insecurity is described as the restrictions imposed on cultural groups which prohibit their practice of customs and traditions, thereby threatening their identity in the process. Several examples by Tehranian also include reference to displaced persons like refugees.

From a **theological** perspective, and specifically in Qur'anic terms, "Being a religion of peace and security for all, it [Islam] is against all forms and types of aggression, oppression, acts of transgression and mischief...5" Indeed, during the time of the Prophet Muhammad (pbuh), there were many non-Muslim tribes who were inhabitants of the holy cities of Makkah Mukarramah and Madinah Munawarrah,together with the Muslims. The Prophet (pbuh) established a constitution6 which provided security and stability to all its citizens so as to foster societal wellbeing and a harmonious, respect-







ful and productive community within which people were free to travel, work – and express their religious identity.

What is evident from each of the definitions above is that irrespective of their discipline and/or the defining institution, the notion of cultural security encompasses an element of **safety**, that is – preservation and protection from change and modification, as these factors are perceived to be threats. The question that arises is the extent to which these practices and efforts can, and at times perhaps do, lead to culturalstagnation.



Corpus Linguistic Search

In order to establish how widely the phrase 'cultural security' is currently in use, a corpus linguistic search of the term was conducted using the Bank of English which contains in excess of 700 million words, and over 29,000 written and spoken texts across 11 subcorpora from the UK, USA and Australia. However, surprisingly, this search only yielded two results (per million words). The first showed the term being used as part of dialogue in a book published in 1998:

'He [Jack] needed the money to get through school, and the devil he knew, he thought, was surely better than the devil he did not...He had also learned "not to be a quitter" from his father, who'd said, "Your career is who you are. It's the path to financial, psychological, and cultural security"...'

The above search result shows cultural security as being synonymous with an individual's standing within the community in association with his/her occupational status. Thus, it is equated tonot only acceptance within and by society, but also financial stability and the subsequent psychological wellbeing.

The second corpus linguistic search result was situated in non-fiction, specifically, a newspaper article published in the Megastar in the year 1992. This article uses the term cultural security in the context of indigenous Canadians, or aboriginal Canadians, when referring to a controversial vote to determine their self-governance, as can be seen below:

'...voters are only being asked if the constitution should be renewed "on the basis" of the consensus reached Aug. 28... The Yes side is comfortable with the hand-shake agreement on the basic principles – Senatereform, aboriginal self-government, Quebec 's cultural security and the division of powers.'

The writer of the above newspaper article presents cultural security as an ethnographic concern which encompasses the preservation of





a culture and its customs, together with the habits and mutual differences of the peoples of the culture in question, and their right to self-governance. Despite being published in 1992, these concerns continue to be of ongoing relevance today, that too in multiple contemporary societies.

One of the guestions that is now often raised, however, is the extent to which the determination to conserve one's culture leads to a lack of progress or development (i.e.: stagnation), as is habitually argued by many in the West when labelling traditional or developingnations as 'backward', 'primitive' and/or 'anti-modernist.' One of the biggest ironies in this equation, is that the very powers and nations who criticise those who wish to preserve cultural security are fearful of its insecurity at various levels in relation to their own interests and goals. The section that follows explores some of these interests.



Cultural Insecurity Fears in the West

Cultural Heritage

Using the cloak of anthropology, many Western nations express the desire to protectcultural heritage and as such, display a willingness to take the necessary steps to enact this protection. Among the common concerns that are communicated in relation to tangible heritageisthe will to guard historical sites and to prevent their destruction. For instance, in 2001, following the Taliban's apparent bombing of the Buddhas of Bamiyan, aUNESCO World Heritage Sitein Afghanistan, Western nations declared this act as "abominable" and a "crime against culture7."Later the same year, after the Twin Tower attacks in New York, the West launched the so-called 'War on Terror', and together with their allies, they alsopledged to rebuild the UNESCO World Heritage Site.

The intentions behind actions to protect culture are, however, rarely completely altruistic. As has been argued by many, the right surrounding the prevention of cultural insecurity appears to be the privilege of powerful, wealthy and dominant nation states. Often, they involve some expropriation of tangible wealth, and the appropriation of foreign land and territories. Also, as aptly described by Harvard University academic, Michael Herfeld8:

That situation [protection of heritage]threatens an even larger insecurity, as the prospect of swelling tides of displaced and dispossessed humanity threatens to create physical danger on the streets. It also undermines the very values of humanism on which the "high culture" tradition—itself, ironically, a proudly borne heritage—claims to have been built, and thereby threatens the well-being of that tradition's self-appointed bearers.





In a similar vein, together with bodies like the United Nations, developed nations engage in the inconsistent application of the notion of protection. For instance, an overriding sense of compassion for Iragis and Kuwaitis was, it was claimed, one of the reasons for the invasion of Iraq, especially to protect cultural heritage and torture at the hands of Saddam Hussein, respectively. Similarly, today, it seems it is the Syrian population who have the sympathy of the West. Yet, this desire to bring about justice rarely applies equally in other countries facing allegedcultural genocide.

Corporate Culture

The notion of cultural security also exists within corporations, and it is for this reason that large companies and organisations have established systems to protect their corporate culture from insecurityby implementing policies on Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) that seek to uphold ethical practices. Typically, such policies also claim to have community wellbeing and environmental protection at the heart of their operations.

Another one of the primary functions of CSR is to ensure that it satisfies the needs of key stakeholders by mitigating risks and upholding good values through transparency, consistency and honesty. Aside from the aforementioned, this makes good business sense, for the way in which the organisation is viewed by its customers and key stakeholders has a direct impact on the success of the business, or otherwise, in terms of loyalty to the company/brand. Hence, any form of insecurity is detrimental to both the reputation and financial standing of the corporation. Thus, "security acts as an enabler for CSR programs9"and...

...by attaching images of 'ethics', 'aid' and 'development'...to consumer products...underlying cultural assumptions are substantiated and materialized.10





Economic (In)Security

Being in an economically stable condition is a basic human needthat transcendscultures. Security of this kind is intrinsically interconnected with a multitude of human needs like housing; access to education; having a balanced, nutritious diet; quality healthcare; and opportunities for employment and social mobility. Economic stability can also affect the social position that individuals have within society due to the way in which they are perceived by their peers in terms of status and prestige,typically measured by their material wealth, worldly benefits andmonetary strength, or lack thereof. It is for these reasons, among others, that economists and politicians declare an interest in being committed to making changes within society that will provide opportunities for equal access to education, employment opportunities and a reduction to social stratification through social mobility.

Over a series of decades, numerous countries have developed legislation pertaining to the minimising of economic loss through maximising economic equality; for instance, the UK developed the Equal Pay Act in 1970 so as to reflect its culture of aiming for equality between men and women. However, despite this Act, and the Equality Act 2010 which also includes an economic component, pay inequalities between the sexes in the UK continues to this day11.

One of the main party manifesto pledges repeatedly found in election campaigns across the globe is the promise to strengthen the economy. This is no coincidence, for it is understood that economic insecurity leads to cultural insecurity for the whole nation, which in turn affects the ranking of the country in the world. Thus, to ensure cultural security, it is imperative to reduce/mitigate "income volatility and the risk of downward mobility into poverty12."





National (In)Security

In contemporary societies, something that is becoming increasingly inseparable from cultural security, is the notion of national security. This takes many forms, from hysteria surrounding immigration and refugee migration, to the need to eradicate humanitarian conflicts in intra- and inter-warring nations; to the current obsession across the world – national security threats stemming from terrorist activities. Yet, where national security is concerned, "...the narrow definition of security tends to focus on material capabilities and the use and control of military force by states13"

The concepts of fairness and justice within national security appear not to apply equally across cultures. For instance, it seems to be permissible for certain nations to protect themselves and their cultures through nuclear armament, while other nations are made to endure paralysing sanctions to deter them from becoming a nuclear power. The decision surrounding who is allegedly responsible enough to use nuclear weapons is taken by so-called 'First World' powers, and this is premised on the unspoken tenet that their national and cultural securityis of greater importance than that of developing nations.

When honesty and integrity are compromised in the name of defence, and tyranny is used as a tool of oppression, suffering becomes inevitable. Often, furtive intentions manifest themselvesonceactions become irreversible. This is usually and largely at the expense of those treated unfairly in the process. For instance, the US-UK alliance against Saddam Hussain was accelerated on the basis of claims by the West that the Iraqi President had stock-piles of 'weapons of mass destruction' (WMD) which could be deployed to strike multiple nations within 45-minutes14:but here, mendacity was brazenly employed to engineer public opinion and manufacture consent to invade Iraq in 2003. The eradication of threats to national and cultural security were also cited as key motivating factors for military action. However, the lies told to the world by the West were exposed when United Nations Inspectors failed to locate any WMDs15 in Iraq.



It would seem, therefore, that "security interests are defined by actors who respond to cultural factors16" and that these factors are not static, but fluid, based not only on changing situations and circumstances, but motives and policies. Irrespective of the nation in question, however, it can be argued that "...national security is threatened by the consequences of events that quickly degrade the quality of life of state and non-state actors alike, thus narrowing-significantly the future range of political choice17." It is commonly accepted that there are two sides to every story; national security is no exception. Some argue that national insecurities are the natural and inevitable outcome of a 'clash of civilisations' where each wants to protect their cultural heritage18, while others are more sceptical about the motives of those claiming to have cultural security at the heart of their military operations.

Security in the Holy Qur'an

Thus far, this paper has discussed the meanings associated with the term cultural security and its usage in contemporary society. It has highlighted how the scope of the term has widened from being linked only to the preservation of the peculiarities of a nation, to the broader aspects of life. The discussion has also explored the threats that can arise as a direct consequence of insecurities.

This final section of the paper aims to focus on references to security in the Holy Qur'an. In particular, it will consider how various verses encapsulate different meanings when referring to the term. The degree to which religious references may be considered as being synonymous with present-day cultural understandings will also be pondered.

To begin with, it is worth stating that while the Qur'an is read by many Muslims across the world, theoverwhelming majority tend to be reluctant to question the meaning of Qur'anic verses due to the sacrosanct nature of the text. However, in refraining from such activity, they also limit their ability to fully engage with the verses, and instead form a superficialor very basic understanding of the





scriptures (if at all). The fearof 'challenging' the words of the Qur'an not only leads to inevitable limitations in comprehension, but also a form of stagnation.

The stagnation referred to above is in relation to the restriction of personal development and intellectual advancement through the teachings of the Holy Qur'an as so many of its readers across the world are unwilling to delve deeply into its exeges is. It is also worth thinking about the extent to which Muslim views of security, as interpreted through the Holy Book, reflect the viewpoints and/or concerns expressed by non-Muslims in relation to the term today. Let us explorethree Qur'anic verses which refer to "security" in an attempt to ascertain their different focus and meaning.

[1] "Do then those who devise evil (plots) feel secure that Allah will not cause the earth to swallow them up, or that the wrath will not seize them from directions they little perceive?" (An-Nahl | Chapter 16, Verse 45)

In the verse above, the Almighty Allah (swt) uses the term 'secure' as part of a rhetorical question aimed at conspirators. Heprompts them to consider whether they truly feel that they are 'secure' from Allah (swt) by thinking that He will ignore their maliciousschemes and not punish them for their mischief-making. Theimplied punishmentscan takedifferent forms, for instance:

that which can be witnessed on earth in the form of natural disasters; i.e.: When Allah states He will "cause the earth to swallow them up" it seems highly likely that this alludes to earthquakes;

in asking "Do then those who devise evil (plots) feel secure that... the wrath will not seize them" the word 'wrath' reflectsthe anger of Divinity at the obstinacy of those who act fearlessly against the commands of Allah (swt);

while "directions they little perceive" indicates that the punishments will not only be sudden, but can take different forms, for instance: hurricanes, tsunamis, earthquakes.





References to Divine punishments can be found in all the Holy books revealed to humankind by God. It is for this reason that some Christianstoday also believe in the wrath of God as being a form of punishment. Examples of this include a Christian leader in the US state of Louisiana in 2016 who warned the population that natural disasters are sent by God as one way to punish gay people.19The same thoughts were reiterated by a US Political Commentator a year later who commented on tropical storms being more likely to be a sign of God's anger about homosexuality, rather than being linked to climate change20.

If we return to the words in chapter 16 and verse 45 of the Holy Qur'an, and relate these to present-day natural disasters such as storms, fires, hurricanes, floods and earthquakes in different parts of the world, it might be argued that as repeatedly stated throughout the Holy Qur'an, indeed, "therein there are signs for those who reflect..."

[2] "Do you think you will you be left in what is here, secure [from death]...?"

(Ash-Shu'ara | Chapter 26, Verse 146)

This Qur'anic verse serves as a reminder of the Day of Judgment. It seeks to urge those who are contented in the comforts of their worldly gains to reflect on the Hereafter and to be mindful of the never-ending life – afterdeath. What is alluded to here, is the following:

- that those who amass wealth, status, power and other similar things which can often be a source of corruption, tend to feel a [false] sense of security and enjoyment in these ephemeral achievements;
- 2. furthermore, this mindset frequently leads them away from Allah (swt) as they become immersed in their material comforts





and acquiring more of the same;

3. such people live their lives as if they will forever remain on earth, and so the use of the word 'secure' in this context is one in which the reader is jolted into remembering what lies beyond their present life.

The above verse and those preceding them were revealed to the people of Thamud by their Prophet, Salih. In verses 141-145, the Prophet stated to the inhabitants of Thamud that he was a trustworthy messenger of Allah, their brother, and one who was not trying to seek any personal gain for his warnings about their disobedience to Allah (swt) in their misplaced sense of security.21

In verse 149of SurahAsh-Shu'ara (Chapter 26), Prophet Salih continues by making explicit reference to dwellings on earth as perceived safe-havens, that is: "And you hew houses (skilfully built) out of the mountains exultingly" for the home is often considered to be a place where people see themselves as being 'secure', yet none is out of the reach of the Almighty.

[3] "Verily, the pious will be in place of security." (Ad-Dukhan | Chapter 44, Verse 51)

In the above verse, it is evident that Allah (swt) promises righteous believers security. According to most clerics, this refers to the Hereafter, while other learned scholars interpret this verse to mean security both in this world, and through a place in paradise. The sense of security being referred encompasses the following underlying notions:

those who remain chaste and are devout and sincere in their worship and commitment to Allah will be protected;

they are ones who successfully resist temptations and wrongdoings to tread the path ordained by the Almighty;

the use of the words "will be" when referring to a "place of secu-





rity" is to be understood as a promise; i.e.: if one is pious, s/he will be secure;

if interpreted simply as the future tense, "will be" may be interpreted as alluding to life in the future, specifically the Hereafter;

the pious will be protected from the insecurity of the hellfire.

When examining the verses that follow the above in chapter Ad-Dukhan, there is no doubt that the word security here most definitely refers to at least the Hereafter, as there are references to "gardens and springs" (verse 52); being dressed in the finest Sundus [silks] (verse 53); and hurs (verse 54). Hence:

"In short, the blessed Verse refers to those whose hearts are secure in this world through faith. They are placed in the place of security. They are secure in their worldly life from concupiscent and satanic desires enjoying the protection of God Almighty. They will also be secure from any affliction in proximity to God in the Hereafter.22"

It can be seen from the three examples selected above that the Qur'an uses the term security/secure to contrast with punishment; it serves as a reminder of the Hereafter; and as a promise related to security in paradise. There are many other chapters of the Holy Qur'an which refer to security (for example: Surah Al-Isra, verse 69; Surah An-Nur, verse 55; Surah Al-Mulk, verse 16; Surah Al-Qasas, verse 31), and in essence, the meaning associated with each use is an iteration of one the aforementioned three examples in this paper.





Concluding Comments

Cultural security can take many forms, as has been discussed herein, and in most cases, this comprises the desire to protect and preserve something of value, be it tangible or intangible. While some individuals or nations may equate the drive to conserve cultural security with a form of stagnation and a lack of development and progression, others from within the same cultures and disciplines seek to uphold the culture due to the importance placed on specific aspects therein.

The degree to which cultural security may be considered synonymous with religious security among believers is debatable, however, what is clear is that irrespective of culture, identity and belonging, humans have a natural and innate desire to seek protection and certainty.

While flexibility and adaptability may be exercised within reason in order to function in contemporary societies, there are values at the core of human behaviour which warrant preservation in any form. In Islam, it can be safely assumed that security lies in obeying the commands of the Almighty Allah (swt) with complete submission to His will, through an unwavering belief and unfaltering trust in the Creator, His words and His guidance for humankind.





References

- 1- Goldstein, Daniel (2010) 'Toward a Critical Anthology of Security.' Current Anthropology. 51, (4): August.
- 2- Barnett, Jon (2001)The Meaning of Environmental Security: Ecological Politics and Policy in the New Security Era. New York: Zed Books
- 3- Australian Human Rights Commission (2011) 'Chapter 4: Cultural safety and security: Tools to address lateral violence Social Justice Report 2011.' Social Justice Report 2011. Available from: http://www.humanrights.gov.au/publications/chapter-4-cultural-safety-and-security-tools-address-lateral-violence-social-justice#Heading118 [Accessed on 8 October 2017]
- 4- Tehranian, Majid (2004) 'Cultural Security & Global Governance: International Migration & Negotiations of Identity.' In Friedman, Jonathan & Randeria, Shalini (eds) Worlds on the Move: Globalisation, Migration and Cultural Security. London: I.B. Tauris in association with The Toda Institute for Global Peace & Policy Research
- 5- Ansari, Ahmed (2015) Al-Islam: The religion of peace, security, dignity &honor. Available from: https://www.islamicity.org/1920/al-islam-the-religion-of-peace-security-dignity-honor/ [Accessed on 17 October 2017]
- 6- Islam Question & Answer (2017) 209600: Islam is a peaceful religion with those who are peaceful. Available from: https://islamqa.info/en/209600 [Accessed on 17 October 2017]
- 7- ABC News (2001, 12 March) U.N. Confirms Destruction of Afghan Buddhas. Available from: http://abcnews.go.com/International/story?id=81406&page=1 [Accessed on 17 October 2017]
- 8- Herzfeld, Michael (2015) 'Heritage and the Right to the City: When Securing the Past Creates Insecurity in the Present.' Journal of Heritage & Society [Online]. Volume 8, (Issue 1). Available from: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1179/2159032X15Z.00000000035
- 9- Kane, Greg (2011) Security's Role in Corporate Social Responsibility. Available from: https://www.securitymagazine.com/articles/81820-securitys-role-in-corporate-social-responsibility [Accessed on 18 October 2017]
- 10- McCracken (1986: 72) cited in Vinicius Brei&Steffen Böhm (2011) 'Corporate social responsibility as cultural meaning management: a critique of





the marketing of 'ethical' bottled water.' Business Ethics – A European Review. Available from: http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1467-8608.2011.01626.x/full [Accessed on 18 October 2017]

- 11- The Guardian (2016, 6 Nov.) Equal pay is still far-off for Britain, where the gender gap narrows at a glacial pace. Available from: https://www. theguardian.com/society/2016/nov/06/equal-pay-gender-gap-britainwomen-earnings-men [Accessed on 19 October 2017]
- 12- Western, Bruce; Bloome, Dierdre; Sosnaud, Benjamin & Tach, Laura (2012) 'Economic Insecurity and Social Stratification.' Annual Review of Sociology. Vol. 38; pp. 341-359.
- 13- Walt (n.d.) cited in Katzenstein, Peter (1996) 'Introduction: Alternative Perspectives on National Security.' In: The Culture of National Security: Norms and Identity in World Politics. Available from: http://www.fb03. uni-frankfurt.de/45503391/Introduction-from-Katzenstein-1996---The-Culture-of-National-Security.pdf [Accessed on 19 October 2017]
- 14- Mail Online (2002) Just 45 minutes from attack. Available from: http:// www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-139703/Just-45-minutes- A.html [Accessed on 19 October 2017]
- 15- BBC News (2004, 7 Oct) Report concludes no WMD in Iraq. Available from: http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/middle east/3718150.stm [Accessed on 19 October 2017]
- 16- Katzenstein, Peter (1996) 'Introduction: Alternative Perspectives on National Security.' In: The Culture of National Security: Norms and Identity in World Politics. Available from: http://www.fb03.uni-frankfurt. de/45503391/Introduction-from-Katzenstein-1996---The-Culture-of-National-Security.pdf [Accessed on 19 October 2017]
- 17- Ullman, Richard (1983) 'Redefining Security.' International Security. Vol. 8; (issue no. 1): pp. 129-53\
- 18- Gunartana, Rohan (2015) 'Cultural Security: evaluating the power of culture in international affairs.' In: Gunaratnalnsurgency & Terrorism Studies. London: Imperial College Press.
- 19 Nelson, Kate (2016, 18 Aug.) 'Louisiana floods destroy home of Christian leader who says God sends natural disasters to punish gay people.' Independent [Online]. Available from: http://www.independent.co.uk/ news/world/americas/christian-home-destroyed-flood-tony-perkinsnatural-disasters-gods-punishment-homosexuality-a7196786.html cessed on 26 October 2017]





20- White, Jeremy (2017, 30 Aug.) 'Ann Coulter says storm Harvey is more likely God's punishment for Houston's lesbian mayor than a result of climate change.' Independent [Online]. Available from: http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/us-politics/ann-coulter-harvey-climate-change-god-punishment-more-credible-tweet-a7919301.html [Accessed on 26 October 2017]

21-Al-Islam.org (2017) Surah Ash-Shu'ara, Verses 146-150. Available from: https://www.al-islam.org/enlightening-commentary-light-holy-quran-vol-12/section-8-salih-preaches-righteousness-people-thamud#surah-ash-shuara-verses-146-150[Accessed on 27 October 2017]

22- Al-Islam.org (2017) Surah al-Dukhan, Chapter 44, Verses 37- 59. Available from: https://www.al-islam.org/enlightening-commentary-light-holy-quran-vol-16/surah-al-dukhan-chapter-44-verses-37-59#surah-al-dukhan-verses-51-53 [Accessed on 27 October 2017]

